Promoting Public Safety Security and Justice

Annual Report 2013
CLEEN FOUNDATION

Promoting Public Safety, Security and Justice
Table of Contents

Message from the Chairman  4
Message from the Executive Director  5
The CLEEN Foundation in 2013  6
Accountability & Justice Programme  8
Public Safety & Security Programme  22
Research & Planning Programme  36
CLEEN Foundation Accounts  42
The year 2013 was significant in the history of CLEEN Foundation. The most significant development during the year was the resignation of the founding Executive Director, Mr. Innocent Chukwuma, in order to take up an appointment as the West African Representative of Ford Foundation. His appointment demonstrated the confidence of Ford Foundation in CLEEN Foundation and a personal recognition of Mr. Chukwuma.

Ford Foundation is one of the major funders of CLEEN Foundation since its establishment. Ms. Kemi Okenyodo, who had been in the employment of the Foundation for about a decade was appointed as the new Executive Director. The transition was unexpectedly smooth, thanks to the commitment and support of the Board Members and staff. The Board and staff of the Foundation acknowledge the contribution of Mr. Chukwuma to the development of the Foundation. He nurtured it from its establishment to maturity. It is gratifying that Ms. Okenyodo settled quickly and the Foundation has experienced transition without crisis.

The Foundation implemented several projects in various programme areas and extended its work into new areas like the study of conflict and youth radicalisation, and security governance in Nigeria and across West Africa. We continue to collaborate with many of our partners, which include Altus Global Alliance; African Policing Civilian oversight Forum (APCOF); Justice for All (J4A) of the British Council and the UK Department for International Development (DFID) in Nigeria; National Human Rights Commission; Nigeria Police Force; Police Service Commission and the Ministry of Police Affairs. We are also building new partnerships with several public and private organisations with a view to strengthening and expanding our programmes and impact.

The Foundation acknowledges the support of our funders, especially the Ford Foundation and MacArthur Foundation. During the year, the Foundation developed a new strategic plan and commissioned an impact assessment. We learnt a lot from the process and the outcomes of the exercises.

We look to the future with great hope, in spite of the challenges in the environment in which we work. It our hope that with continuing support from our funders and partners and devotion to duty by our staff, the Foundation will continue to conceive and implement projects that will promote security and justice in Nigeria and beyond.
The year 2013 featured the transition in CLEEN Foundation from the Founder Executive Director, Mr. Innocent Chukwuma to me, after fifteen years of steering the ship of the organisation. The transition was seamless due to support from my colleagues and Board.

The insecurity in the northern part of the country caused by the activities of the Jama’atu Ahlis Sunna Lidda’awati Wal-Jihad, otherwise known as Boko Haram, is the main contemporary threats facing the nation. This has raised to the forefront the nexus between security and governance; mapping and identifying actors that are involved in improving public safety and security apart from the formal government agencies. The responsibilities of all formal and informal actors have to be identified and they need to be strengthened to play mutually-beneficial roles. This formed the core of our interventions in the year 2013.

Our program areas were focused on enhancing public accountability, active participation by citizens, and conducting of various studies to get empirical data to substantiate our hypothesis and/or assumptions. Our engagement continued to involve the police, other law enforcement and security agencies, voluntary policing groups, traditional justice institutions, oversight agencies and other civil society organisations.

We rolled out our Security and Governance Project in the South Eastern part of the country after releasing the findings from our study on Insecurity and Governance in the South East. The roll-out involved a series of Local Governance Security Fora which brought together local government officials, security agencies and community leaders to discuss the governance and security issues in their local governments, with a view to proffering solutions to identified problems. We have continuously engaged law enforcement agencies through training workshops on different thematic issues. These included, for example, workshops on the following themes: Improving Police Response to Gender Based Violence, and The Importance of the Freedom of Information Act to Police Oversight Agencies.

In light of the high patronage of voluntary policing groups by citizens, CLEEN Foundation – as part of the Justice For All Consortium – has continued to implement an intervention program aimed at improving the organization and coordination of these groups. This has involved developing and implementing strategies and organising capacity building activities to improve their service delivery, accountability, and management processes.

Towards the 2015 general elections, we published two editions of our periodic security threat assessments in 2013, under our flagship Election Security Management project, which is supported by the MacArthur Foundation. We observed the conduct of the police and other law enforcement and security agencies during the gubernatorial elections held in Anambra State in November 2013.

The change in the public safety and security environment in the country and the in-house transition necessitated our conducting an institutional impact assessment and review of the our 5-year strategic plan for the period 2009 to 2013. The process, supported by Ford Foundation, enabled us to document lessons from our years of operation as well as our areas of strength, influence, and weakness over the past 16 years.

We have enjoyed continued support from our partners, donors, members of the board, friends, and my colleagues, who have not relented in their support of the organisation to realise its vision, goals and objectives.
About the CLEEN Foundation

Purpose

The CLEEN Foundation is registered with the Nigerian Corporate Affairs Commission as a non-profit organisation and its accounts are independently audited and published annually. We look forward to receiving the support of all stakeholders in pursuit of our mission.

Vision

We aspire to be the leading civil society organization on public safety, security, and justice in Africa.

Mission

To promote public safety, security and justice through empirical research, legislative advocacy, demonstration programmes and publications in partnership with government and civil society.

Core Values

The governing principles that guide our behaviour as individuals and what defines us as an institution include:

1. Professionalism
2. Integrity
3. Team spirit
4. Respect for human rights
5. Innovation

Governance of the CLEEN Foundation

The CLEEN Foundation’s Board of Directors meets quarterly and is active in all aspects of the Foundation’s work. Board members provide input and assistance in various programmes and departments, usually in their areas of expertise, and they oversee all financial and management issues within the organisation.

The members of the Board are well-respected persons with a history of meritorious service in the Foundation’s areas of work.

Chairman - Prof. Etannibi Alemika

Prof. Alemika obtained his PhD with distinction in criminology from University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A in 1985 and is currently a professor of criminology and sociology of law at the University of Jos, Nigeria. He is a leading authority on police and policing in Nigeria and his research interest traverse criminology, penology, criminal justice policy, sociology of law and research methodology. (alemikae@yahoo.com)

Member - Ayo Obe

Mrs. Ayo Obe is a human rights lawyer and former president of the Civil Liberties Organization, the pioneer human rights organization in Nigeria. She was formerly a member of the Police Service Commission, the civilian oversight body on policing in Nigeria, representing non-governmental organizations. (amoo@alpha.linkserve.com)
Member - Frank Odita
A retired Commissioner of Police and former public relations chief of the Nigeria Police Force. Mr. Odita was responsible for the establishment of the Police Public Complaints Bureau (PCB) during his tenure as the image-maker of the Nigeria Police Force in the 90s. He is currently, the presenter of Security Watch on television, a magazine programme that acts as ombudsman on public safety and security in Nigeria.

Member - Josephine Effah Chukwuma
A leading activist on gender based violence and women’s human rights in Nigeria. Mrs. Chukwuma pioneered the establishment of shelter for female victims of violence in Nigeria and is currently the executive director of Project Alert on Violence against Women, a nongovernmental organization that provides information on various forms of violence against women and support services to victims in Nigeria. (josephine@projectalertnig.org)

Secretary - Kemi Okenyodo
Ms. Okenyodo takes over the helm of affairs of the CLEEN Foundation with the exit of founder, Mr. Innocent Chukwuma, having been with the Foundation for ten years. She is a leading advocate and driver of police and criminal justice reform in Nigeria and West African sub-region. She is also a director of Altus, a global alliance of nongovernmental organizations and academic centres working on public safety, security and accessible justice across 5 continents from a multicultural perspective.

The CLEEN Foundation Team

1. Kemi Okenyodo: Executive Director
2. Chinedu Nwagu: Program Manager, Abuja
3. Nengak Daniel: Program Manager, Lagos
4. Blessing Abiri: Senior Program Officer - Accountability and Justice/Altus Regional Representative
5. Valkamya Ahmadu: Senior Program Officer - Public Safety and Security
6. Anyanwu C. Ifeanyi: Program Officer - Public Safety and Security
7. Chigozirim Odinkalu-Okoror: Program Officer - Public Safety and Security
8. Raphael Mbaegbu: Program Officer - Research and Strategy Development
9. Enayaba I. Napoleon: Asst. Program Officer - Public Safety and Security
10. Ebere Mbaegbu: Asst. Program Officer
11. Akinremi Gabriel: Senior System Administrator/Webmaster
12. Nkechi Onyeanisi: Account/Admin Officer
13. Ezekiel Ojo: Assist Account/Admin Officer
14. Blessing Nwokolo: Senior Admin Assistant
15. Clara C. Amadi: Program/ Admin Officer
The Accountability and Justice Programme of the CLEEN Foundation works to enhance accountability in the operations of security agencies within the Foundation’s area of operation. (For more information on the programme, please see the sidebar entitled The Accountability and Justice Programme. The programme ran two principal groups of activities in 2013 under its Accountability Project. These were:

1. The annual Altus Police Station Visitation Activities, and
2. The workshops on traditional justice systems

Altus Police Station Visitation Activities

The Altus Police Station Visitors Week 2013

The annual Altus Police Station Visitors Week (PSVW) aims to educate communities and activists about the conditions under which their local police stations work and to strengthen the accountability of the police to the people they serve. (Please see the sidebar About the Altus Police Station Visitors Week on page??? for more information about this event.)

Globally, the 2013 edition of the Visitors Week took place from November 3 to 9, 2013 and featured twenty-two participating countries worldwide, with seven from Africa: Benin, Cameroun, Ghana, Kenya, Liberia, Nigeria, and Sierra Leone. The CLEEN Foundation coordinated the PSVW in Africa in partnership with local civil society organisations and governmental agencies. The visitors comprised students, members of civil society organisations (especially women’s groups), and officials of government agencies with oversight responsibilities for the police. Others came from private sector organisations, market women associations, and organisations representing special interest groups such as ethnic minorities and persons with disability. These visitors visited a minimum of 20 police stations in each of the participating countries.

The PSVW in Nigeria took place from November 18 to 23, 2013 in partnership with the National Human Rights Commission.
ACCOUNTABILITY AND JUSTICE PROGRAMME

The Accountability and Justice Programme has charge of CLEEN Foundation’s work in the enhancement of accountability in policing and security operations, the mainstreaming of gender issues and perspectives in the policy formulation and operations of security organisations, and the pursuit of their overall institutional reform through legislation to enhance their functioning as effective security instruments in a democratic society.

The programme achieves its mandate through three project units: the Accountability Project, the Legislative Advocacy Project, and the Gender and Policing Project.

Accountability Project: The overriding objective of the Accountability Project is the strengthening of internal and external processes and mechanisms for holding law enforcement and security agencies accountable for their conduct in the discharge of their duties and the making of such mechanisms open for use by members of the public.

Legislative Advocacy Project: The Legislative Advocacy Project advocates for the review, repeal, or amendment of obnoxious laws that inhibit respect for the due process safeguards of criminal suspects, and encourages the enactment of laws and the domestication of ratified international treaties that promote observance of human rights by law enforcement and other security agencies.

Gender and Policing Project: The Gender and Policing Project promotes gender equality in policing and works to improve the treatment of women in criminal justice administration.

RIGHT: Mr Harry Obe of the National Human Rights Commission (centre) during the press briefing to announce the 2013 Police Station Visitors Week

BELOW: Participants in the 2013 pre-visit training workshop for police station visitors in Lagos
About the Altus Police Station Visitors' Week

The Police Station Visitors' Week is a yearly event organised by the Altus Global Alliance (www.altus.org) since 2006 to facilitate interaction between citizens and police formations in participating countries. This is by means of organised visits by citizens to police stations to familiarise them with the operations and challenges of the police force and with detention conditions at police stations.

Altus aims by this means to promote police accountability and transparency to the communities they serve, thus enabling each side to appreciate the concerns and needs of the other and to find common grounds through dialogue on which they may establish common interests and better police-community cooperation.

By identifying and rewarding good practices among participating police forces during the Visitors’ Week, Altus also employs the event as an instrument to encourage the adoption of best practices amongst these forces, governments, and civil society organisations around the world. The Police Station Visitors’ Week is therefore an important instrument of civilian (or external) oversight over these police forces.

Citizens visiting the stations assess them on community orientation, physical conditions, equal treatment of the public, transparency and accountability, and detention conditions. Altus collates the results of the assessment and scores the police stations to arrive at a decision on the best performing stations, which receive "best performers" awards during the next edition of the Police Station Visitors’ Week. For more information on the event and the scoring scheme for participating police stations, please visit Altus at www.altus.org.

Altus Police Station

Station visitations in the 2013 Police Station Visitors Week in Nigeria took place in most of the participating states from November 18 to 23, with visitations in four states (Abia, Rivers, Kano and Zamfara) taking place from November 25 to 26. The visitors generally had complete access to the participating police stations, except in a few cases where access was limited or denied outright on grounds that the station authorities had not received authorisation from superior authorities.

Federal Capital Territory and Northern Region

The CLEEN Foundation on November 15, 2013 held a pre-visit workshop in Abuja for over 100 representatives of civil society organisations and local communities from Abuja to train them in the modalities of the visitations. A similar programme also held for officials of the Ministry of Police Affairs. The Foundation had earlier on November 20 held pre-visit training workshops for almost four thousand persons participating in the visits in Gombe, Jigawa, Katsina, Nassarawa, Niger, Plateau, Zamfara, Bauchi, Kaduna, and Kano states.

Following these workshops, the actual police station visitation held in the Federal Capital Territo-
Visitors Week in Nigeria

ry (FCT) on November 19, 2013 during which citizens and civil society activists successfully visited and inspected 22 police stations. They were however denied access to four police stations, namely Garki Police Station, Kuje Police Station, Kubwa Police Station, and Asokoro Police Station. The visits in all but two of the selected northern states took place on November 21: the Kano state visits took place on November 25 and the Zamfara visits on the next day. Like in the case of the FCT, although these visits were generally successful the visitors were denied access to some police stations. For example, the Gamainsa Police Station in Jigawa State and the Malali Police Station in Kaduna state denied visitors access. Similarly, the Area Command Division of Jos in Plateau state and some Divisional Police Officers across the states denied visitors access on the ground that they had no formal authorisation from higher authorities, in some cases, particularly the Inspector-General of Police.

Lagos and South-West Region

In Lagos, the pre-visit training workshop held on November 18, 2013 and November 19, 2013. Over 200 participants were trained by members of staff of the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) staff at the NHRC office. The workshops in Ogun and Oyo states held on November 20, 2013.

The actual police station visitation took place in Lagos from November 19 to 22, with about 87 out of the selected 105 police stations granting access to the visitors. A few stations limited the visitors’ access to detention areas, while 12 police stations completely denied access.1 The visits in Ogun and

Oyo states took place the same day as the pre-visit training workshops. Only two of the seven selected police stations in the former granted the visitors access, those that denied access being Ibafo Police Station, Sango Police Station, Ifo Police Station, Ibara Police Station, and Lafenwa Police Station. In contrast, eight of the ten selected police stations in Oyo State granted access, the Mapo Police Station, and Dugbe Police Station being the exceptions.

South-South and South-East Regions

The pre-visit training workshops in Enugu, Imo and Akwa-Ibom states held on November 21, 2013, those in Anambra and Ebonyi states on November 22, and in Abia and Rivers states on November 25.

The actual station visits took place in these states on the same day as their training workshops. As in other regions, the visitors generally gained access to most of the selected police stations but not to a number of others. In Enugu State, Abakpa Police Station denied the visitors access, as did the Umuna Police Station, Otoko Police Station, Umuagwo Police Station, and Shell Camp Police Station in Imo State, in which however twenty-eight police stations granted access. All ten selected stations in Ebonyi State granted the visitors access, while six of ten did in Anambra State.

In Rivers state, nine police stations granted access with only one, the Mini Okoro Police station, refusing access to the visitors; visitors in Abia State were able, after initial difficulties, to gain access to the ten police stations that participated in the State.

The J4A Model Police Stations

With a view to increasing advocacy on the need to remodel police stations across the country to improve police services and accountability as well as community engagement, the Justice for All (J4A) had selected certain stations across the country as model police stations (MPS) and dissemination police stations (PDS). These stations took part in the police stations visitation exercise.

---

1 Onikan Police Station, Amukoko Police Station, Yaba Police Station, Sabo Police Station, Ejigbo Police Station, Pen Cinema Police Station, Oko-Oba Police Station, Anthony Police Station, Gowon Estate Police Station, Ikorodu Police Station, and Ilasan Police Station.
Commission (NHRC) in exercise of its legal mandate. The CLEEN Foundation and the Commission coordinated over 300 police station visits in 20 states across the six geopolitical zones in the country as well as the Federal Capital Territory (FCT). The visitors included members of staff of the Commission, local citizens, and members of civil society organisations. Please see the story Altus Police Station Visitors Week in Nigeria on page 12 for details on this event.

Prior to the actual police stations visitations, the CLEEN Foundation and its project partner the National Human Rights Commission organised a series of preparatory activi-

1 Section 6 (1)(d) of the National Human Rights Commission (Amendment) Act 2011 empowers the commission to visit prisons, police cells, and other places of detention in order to ascertain the conditions thereof and make recommendations to the appropriate authorities.
2 The states were Abia, Anambra, Ebonyi, Enugu, Imo, Lagos, Rivers, Akwa-Ibom, Bauchi, Gombe, Kano, Kaduna, Katsina, Jigawa, Zamfara, Niger, Plateau, Nassarawa, Ogun, and Oyo.

Continued on page 14
The CLEEN Foundation on September 10, 2013 held a ceremony to present the Victoria Island Police Station in Lagos, Nigeria with the regional and continental Altus Police Station Visitors Week awards as the best performing police station in West Africa and Africa in 2012. In adjudging it the 2012 winner, the Altus Global Alliance had noted that the station had a close relationship with its host community, featured remarkably adequate physical conditions, practiced equality in its treatment and interactions with members of staff and of the community, was transparent and accountable in its operations, respected the rights of detainees, and provided good detention conditions.

Mr. Frank Odita, a member of the CLEEN Foundation Board of Directors, while presenting the awards to the station’s Divisional Police Officer (DPO), CSP Adegoke Fayoade, commended him for his patriotism and contribution to the police stations at which he had served. He noted that CSP Fayoade had previously served at the Ilupeju Police Station, Lagos, which had also won the Altus PSVW national award for two consecutive years under his leadership. CSP Fayoade, in his paper titled ‘People-Centric, Prevention and Basic Law Enforcement Driven Strategies in the Police of Victoria Island’ presented at the occasion, attributed the success of the station to its twin strategies of ‘door-to-door policing’ and ‘smart policing’. He thanked the CLEEN Foundation for its continuous support and efforts to promote public safety and building relationship between the police and the public.

Present at the award ceremony were members of the Nigerian Police Force, representatives of banks and financial institutions, the National Human Rights Commission, Lagos State Security Trust Fund, civil society organisations and the media.

The 2012 Police Station Visitors Week, the 6th in the annual series, took place from December 3 to 9, 2012, and involved 61 civil society organisations. Seventeen countries participated in the event, including six in Africa (Benin, Cameroun, Ghana, Kenya, Liberia, and Nigeria). One thousand police stations all over the world welcomed 5,842 citizens to inspect their facilities and ask questions about their operations. One thousand one hundred and fifty three of these visitors were in Africa, and they visited 343 police stations in the six participating countries. In Nigeria, Eight hundred and ninety seven (897) citizens took part in the visits to the 262 participating police stations, which were drawn from 14 police state commands.1

The visitors in all the participating countries assessed the police stations in five key areas:

1. Community orientation
2. Physical conditions of the police station
3. Equal treatment of members of the public
4. Transparency and accountability
5. Detention conditions

Continued from page 12

ties. These included a press conference by the Commission on November 15, 2013 to announce the commencement of the police station visitation week, a number of Training-of-Trainers (ToT) workshops by the Foundation for members of the Commission, and training and sensitisation workshops for prospective visitors. The ToT workshops in Abuja and Lagos for NHRC coordinators in the northern regions and the South-West region held on the same day as the press conference, while that in Owerri for the counterparts in the South-South and South-East regions took place on November, 19, 2013. The CLEEN Foundation conducted follow-up activities to the PSVW in December 2013 and January 2014. These included:

1. The publishing of the national and regional reports on the visitation programme
2. The award of certificates to the winning police stations at the national level in the participating countries
3. A regional meeting to share experiences on the PSVW and to announce the winning police station in the region
4. A discussion forum in Nigeria (in partnership with the National Human Rights Commission) to review the findings of the PSVW, involving a comparison of the conditions of detention in police stations in Nigeria since 2009
5. A press conference to announce the results of the PSVW
6. A national award ceremony To recognise the winning police stations in Nigeria

The results of the visitation programme included:

1. The development of a good practice guide for the police on conditions of detention in Nigeria
2. Human rights training for the police on identified areas of shortcoming

The Police Station Visitors Week (PSVW) in Nigeria was supported by the United Kingdom (UK) Department for International Development (DFID) under its Chase and Justice for All Programme (J4A).

Validation Visits to 2012 Top Police Stations
The 8th District Police Station in Nkon–Kana, Yaoundé, Cameroon and the Victoria Island Police Station in Lagos, Nigeria had tied for the top position in the 2012 edition of the Altus Police Station Visitors Week in Africa. Both had received very high scores across the five indicator areas used for the performance rankings and the assessors could not determine which was the better performer. The Altus team therefore paid visits to these stations in May and June 2013 respectively to verify their scores and determine the regional winner for the PSVW 2012. The team, comprising three independent citizens, compared conditions in each police station and scored them according to criteria developed by Altus. The visit involved:

1. Physical inspection of all the services and facilities that the 2012 PSVW visitors had scored, to verify the objectivity of the scoring and to ensure that scores were computed according to the rules;
2. Interview with the Station Commander on the five key areas of
The outcome of the verification was that the visitation team ruled in favour of the Victoria Island Police Station. In respect of the five key areas, they found that the station:

1. Was very much community-oriented, running programmes to integrate itself with the community it serves. These included its “door-to-door policing” programme, in which police officers visit community members in their homes and business places to familiarise themselves with citizens and sensitize them on security issues and provide them the telephone numbers and other contact details of the principal officers of the local station.

2. Pursued police-community confidence-building by also pasting these contact details at easily accessible places outside the police station. This helped build the confidence of members of the public to report crime and assist the police in combating crime in the area.

3. Collaborated and engaged closely with the community through such measures as the Police-Community Stakeholders Meeting, Police-Community Relations Committee, as well as regular meetings with the Landlord/Tenant Associations and the Beach Settlers Association.

4. Practised equal treatment of all members of the public by a policy of entertaining all type of cases (including those related to gender and domestic issues), prioritising mediation and other types of alternative dispute resolution over litigation, and providing segregated cells and toilet facilities for female and male detainees and officers.

5. Pursued the capacity development of its officers and men by running weekly lectures on ‘policing by respect’ to enhance civility in the performance of their policing duties.

The verification team concluded from the visit that the 2012 visitors’ rating of the Victoria Island Police Station reflected the true state of affairs at the station and that the station satisfied the requirements in the five indicator areas largely. The team also found many strong points in the performance of the 8th District Police Station in Nkon-Kana, Yaoundé, Cameroon. In respect of the five key areas of assessment, the team found that the station:

1. The station was clean and orderly, and had adequate space and...
an adequate number of officers to perform its policing duties effectively
2. Pursued a partnership programme with the community which included principally meetings with market heads, community chiefs or quarter heads, bike riders, vigilante groups and informants on safety and security issues
3. Ensured transparency and accountability by providing the public with the phone number of the Commissioner, conducting on-site monitoring and supervision of its officers
4. Enjoyed good relations with officials of the social welfare department
5. Sought to facilitate interaction and relations with vulnerable groups and victims of gender violence by deploying female officers to the front desk

On the other hand, the team found that:

1. The stations’ facilities and equipment were generally inadequate, particularly in respect of office equipment and patrol vehicles
2. Both male and female detainees used the same toilet facilities
3. The station was pervaded by an offensive odour from the nearby marketplace
4. There was room for improvement in the station’s community engagement, there being a particular need for regular police-community forums

The team concluded from its findings that, although the station performed well in some of the key assessment areas, the rating of the 8th District Police Station by the 2012 visitors was too high and did not reflect the reality on ground at the police station and that the station did not satisfy requirements in the five indicator areas. The team therefore adjudged the Victoria Island Police Station the regional winner. See the sidebar *Victoria Island Police Station Wins PSVW 2012 Awards* for the report on the ceremony at which the station received the award.

**Annual Global Award Ceremony and Conference**

Following the Altus Police Station Visitors Week 2012, the Altus Global Alliance – in collaboration with the CLEEN Foundation and the USALAMA Forum (Kenya) – organised the annual global award ceremony and conference to honour the five winning police stations and to share the examples of good practices globally. The event with the theme ‘Police Practices, Processes and Innovations’, took place on August 8 and 9, 2013 at
the Laico Regency Hotel in Nairobi, Kenya, and had in attendance representatives of the various countries from the five continents that participated in the Police Station Visitors’ Week, 2012.

The event began on August 8, 2013 with the conference, an Africa/Asia Regional gathering on the subject *The Altus PSVW and Police Accountability in Developing Countries*, with participants representing the police and civil society groups from the countries that participated in the PSVW 2012 in Africa and Asia. Opening with remarks by Ms. Kemi Okenyodo (Executive Director, CLEEN Foundation), Mr. David Kimaiyo (Inspector General of Police, Kenya), and Ms. Karen Goldstein (Vice President and Interim Director, Vera Institute), the conference featured paper presentations and a roundtable discussion. The presentations included:

1. *The Concept of Community Policing Centre: The India Experience*, by Dr. Rainuka Dagar – IDC
2. *Kenya Experiences and Assessment of Police Stations*, by Mr. Philip Onguje and Usalama Forum
3. *Brazilian Forum on Public Safety*, by Mr. Gerardo Perez, Brazilian Forum on Public Safety (BFPS)
4. *Building Model Police Stations and Link to PVSW*, by Ms. Blessing Abiri, CLEEN Foundation
5. *Los Angeles County Sheriff’s Department Experiences*, by Chief James Lopez, Los Angeles County Sheriff’s Department
6. *Police Reforms in the Region and PVSW Lessons*, by Professor Hugo Fruhling, CIPREVI.

The award ceremony and dinner held after the conference and featured the presentation of awards and certificates to the winning police stations from the five regions for their exemplary performances. The event also provided an opportunity to showcase good and innovative practices that these police stations had developed to improve police services in their respective countries.
Iganmuland as its case study because of its high level of development, and the largeness and heterogeneity of the population within its area of jurisdiction.

The workshop involved presentations on the key aspects of the study that were relevant to the validation of its findings. These were its methodology and approaches (presented by Ms. Toyin Falade), literature consulted (Prof. Akin Ibidapo-Obe, Department of Political Science, University of Lagos), and the findings of its case study (both Prof. Ibidapo-Obe and Ms. Falade). The participants engaged in lively discussions of these and other aspects of the study and offered suggestions to improve the report of findings. These were taken into consideration in the final report of findings that was subsequently published and presented to the Lagos State traditional council and relevant government ministries.

The Lagos study was one of the pilot projects under the traditional justice systems initiative and, as Ms. Okenyodo informed participants at the validation workshop, was to serve as a model for other states. In the same strain, the Component Manager of the Justice for All (J4A) programme, Mr. Danladi Plang, had reported to them that the pilot project in Jigawa State had led to the training of traditional leaders on contemporary human rights issues in general and in particular connection with Islamic law. The training also included alternative dispute resolution, judicial record-keeping, and data-collection in respect of cases.
ACCOUNTABILITY AND JUSTICE PROGRAMME

CLEEN Foundation set up Model Police Station and Legal Advice Scheme

The CLEEN Foundation, under the Justice for All (J4A) programme, recently introduced a new initiative targeting reforms at the local police station level. This initiative called the Model Police Station (MPS) project, adopted a bottom-up approach aimed at remodelling local police stations in terms of building structures, facilities, strategies, processes and services offered. This, it is believed, not only improved services offered and accountability of the police at the local police station level, but also, led to an enhanced perception of the police as an effective and efficient institution by citizens. It further enhanced citizens’ willingness to cooperate with the police.

The project targeted improving systems and procedures of operations at police stations in order to enhance the quality of police services. It provided an environment where the police worked with members of the community to address crime and other problems faced by the citizens, for the ultimate satisfaction of end users.

It integrated the concepts of community policing, community safety, neighbourhood policing and crime prevention thus creating an environment where responsibility for the prevention of crime and improving community safety was jointly taken up by the police and the public.

Model Police Stations were set up in Lagos, Enugu, and Kano States and various initiatives were consequently introduced under this platform in Lagos State. These included the Agege Community Safety Partnership which brought together key stakeholders and actors in Agege, the pilot community, to address issues of safety and security of the citizens and community, and the Legal Advice scheme at Isokoko police station. The pilot Model Police Station (MPS) and the Legal Advance schemes have been extended to eleven (11) other police stations in Lagos State namely; Ajah Police Station, Tolu Police Station, Aguda Police Station, Mushin Police Station, Ojo Police Station, Ikeja Police Station, Pen Cinema Police Station, Bariga Police Station, Ishashi Police Station, Idimu Police Station and, Ikorodu Police Station.

The introduction of the Model Police Station platform in Lagos State spurred an improvement in the rating, by citizens themselves, to the police response to citizens’ needs. These successes informed the up-scale and replication of the project in more states in the country.

The Legal Advance Scheme, another initiative under the MPS platform had as objective, ensuring the fair and proper treatment of suspects and detainees in police custody, in accordance with international human rights standards. It also encouraged transparency, and accountability in the police force. Under the Legal Advance Scheme, the police was more actively involved in engaging the community through its partnership with Voluntary Policing Sector (VPS) groups. The Voluntary Policing Sector (VPS) project is coordinated by CLEEN Foundation in Nigeria.

CLEEN Foundation in conjunction with the J4A project documented the good practices recorded by the project, and expects that the Nigeria Police Force (NPF) will adopt the model across all police stations in the country.

The Justice for All (J4A) programme is a joint initiative between the governments of the United Kingdom and Nigeria.
Police External Accountability Project

Rationale, Goals, and Strategies
The CLEEN Foundation’s Police External Accountability Project addresses issues arising from or associated with poor external oversight over police operations and conduct in Nigeria. Resulting from the public’s lack of interest in the police and its work due to poor service delivery by the force, inadequate citizen oversight over policing has dire implications for police force performance in respect of citizen security, relations between the police and the communities they serve, and the effective functioning of the force as an element in the development of democracy in the country. The problem of poor citizen oversight is therefore of key concern to the CLEEN Foundation, given our goals of enhancing police community partnerships and enhancing the capacity of the police force to function effectively within a democratic setting.

The Foundation’s specific goals under the Police External Accountability Project are to:

1. Ensure collaboration and synergy between police oversight agencies in a bid to improve their functions in overseeing the police
2. Improve the capacity police external agencies to appropriately manage, investigate and make referrals to relevant agencies of complaints against the police
3. Engage them on the supply side in building the capacity of the police on human rights issues

We pursue these goals by strategies and methodologies founded on the principle of engaging pro-actively with all stakeholders to work cooperatively towards addressing problems. These strategies and methodologies include:

1. Periodic engagement between the leadership of police external accountability agencies to ensure effective overseeing of the police
2. Engaging designated staff of police oversight agencies through meetings of the Technical Working Group and the Steering Committee to ensure effective synergy in overseeing the police
3. Supporting police external agencies to create more awareness on their functions and how they can be engaged by

A direct outcome of this project has been better coordination among the participating oversight agencies, the further development of which should improve their effectiveness in overseeing policing operations and police conduct in Nigeria. The CLEEN Foundation plans to continue its role in facilitating this process and, by this, in helping to build a modern and effective police force best suited to Nigeria’s democratic regime.
ACCOUNTABILITY AND JUSTICE PROGRAMME

4. Collaborating with police oversight agencies in delivering human rights and investigative training for the police, and
5. Together with oversight agencies, organising public hearings on human rights abuses by the police

Implementing these strategies and methodologies involve coordinating constant engagement between police oversight agencies to ensure effective implementation of their mandate as provided by law in checking the police. This entails monthly committee meetings, periodic meetings with the leadership of the various agencies, building the capacity of oversight agencies and the police, and raising awareness of the agencies among members of the public.

The project has received solid support from the police force and the leadership of the principal oversight agencies, including the Public Complaints Commission (PCC), the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC), and the Police Service Commission (PSC).

Activities of the Project
Among the activities of the project in 2013 were the following:

1. The inauguration of a Steering Committee and a Technical Committee for the project, both of which meet monthly basis. The members of the committees are drawn from the NHRC, the PCC, the PSC, and the Ministry of Police Affairs. These committees have aided collaboration among these oversight agencies through interactions in their regular meetings.
2. The collation of baseline information and data of complaints received by oversight agencies concerning the police.
3. The development of a one-year action plan at the first quarterly meeting (held in the last quarter of the year) of civil society organisations and various police oversight agencies, including the NHRC. The plan provides for, among other things, human rights trainings for the police (to be done in collaboration with the NHRC); visits to detention centres, and press conferences on detention conditions in them. Many of these activities were implemented in the year.
4. The holding of a training workshop on the Freedom of Information Act on October 29, 2013 for forty staff members of the participating oversight agencies to equip them with the necessary skills and knowledge they require to fulfil their obligations under the FOI Act. The training was a structured training aimed at equipping participants with a sense of what the Freedom of Information Act is all about, how they can apply it to their work, particularly with regards to steps to take in answering Freedom of Information request. The participants were drawn from the Ministry of Police Affairs, the Police Service Commission, the National Human Rights Commission and the Public Complaints Commission.

The training of police personnel on investigation and human rights in the south-eastern states, done in collaboration with the NHRC.

The holding of a leadership and mandate seminar from December 16 to 18, 2013 in Minna, Niger State for heads of police oversight agencies. The seminar resulted in agreements to develop a software to assist the four police oversight agencies in tracking complaints against the police by the public, harmonise into one document the code of conduct for policing during elections and the police code of conduct, and to put the use and discharge of fire arms under the supervision of the NHRC and PSC.

A direct outcome of the project has been better coordination among the participating oversight agencies, the further development of which should improve their effectiveness in overseeing policing operations and police conduct in Nigeria. The CLEEN Foundation plans to continue its role in facilitating this process and, by this, in helping to build a modern and effective police force best suited to Nigeria’s democratic regime.
In 2013, the Public Safety and Security Programme implemented projects on conflict and security, enhancing capacity of voluntary policing groups, and gender issues in policing.

The Justice for All (J4A) programme comprises a group of organisations, including CLEEN Foundation, working in the policing and justice sectors in Nigeria. CLEEN Foundation, in particular has contributed to the police reforms process in the country, and improved citizens’ access to justice through various reform programmes and initiatives that were introduced by the organisation under its public safety and security programme.

The Women Preventing Extreme Violence (WPEV) project trained women that will be in the forefront in the fight against violent extremism.

The Gender and Policing project trained police officers on gender sensitive policing because of the current spate of security challenges that have affected the country. The police were trained in particular, on issues of rape, gender-based violence, and youth restiveness.

The Stop-the-bribes project monitored the activities of the Nigerian police in its fight against corruption. The platform collated reports of complaints and commendations against the police all over the federation.

Stop-the-Bribe: Tackling Low-Level Corruption in the Police Force

Background, Purpose and Goals
The CLEEN Foundation formally launched and deployed its Stop-the-Bribe platform on February 18, 2013 in Abuja at a public event with fifty persons in attendance from the civil society, the diplomatic community, the mass media, development agencies, and a wide variety of trade and market associations, as well as community-based organisations. The launch and deployment of the platform was the first
The Public Safety and Security Programme is responsible for the CLEEN Foundation’s work in advancing human rights and democratic governance principles in the management of conflict, in voluntary policing by citizens, and in relations between the formal police force and the youths. It does this through three project units: the Conflict Prevention Project, the Informal Policing Project, and the Youth and Policing Project.

**Conflict Prevention Project:** This project unit works to build the capacity of communities, the police, and security agents to develop and respond pro-actively to triggers of conflict.

**Informal Policing Project:** The core purpose of this project unit is to improve service delivery of community initiatives for crime and conflict prevention in a manner that promotes accountability and partnership with police and the community.

**Youth and Policing Project:** This project unit works with public schools, police divisions, and juveniles in slum communities to influence young people away from crime and juvenile delinquency with a view to:

1. Bridging the gap between the police and youth
2. Getting the police to understand youth issues and challenges
3. Engaging young people in activities that keep them off the streets

Working through these units, the Programme pursues the tasks set for it in the current strategic plan of the Foundation, i.e., to work for:

1. Improved perception of safety and security in Nigeria especially in focal states of Lagos, Abuja, and Kano
2. Improved collaboration and partnership between the police and community initiatives in crime and conflict prevention
3. Reduced levels of youth crime and juvenile delinquencies in challenged communities in Lagos State

Police and media representatives at the launch and deployment of the Stop-the-Bribe Platform on February 18, 2013

activity in the Foundation’s Stop-the-Bribe project, its intervention to combat low-level corruption among security officials in particular and public servants in general.

The project arose from the findings of the Foundation’s annual National Crime and Safety Survey, in each edition of which respondents consistently reported low-level corruption among public officials involving demands for bribe. Recognising the adverse consequences of corruption for human rights, democratic governance, and the performance of governmental agencies, the CLEEN Foundation designed the Stop-the-Bribe project to take advantage of new technologies and popular desire for action against the problem. The project aims to extend the scope of the fight against low-level corruption through the use of such technologies as social media and multimedia devices, including computers, mobile phones, and other hand-held devices. More specifically, the objectives of the project are to:

1. Create a platform that utilizes technology to enable easy reporting

Continued on page 27
2015 Election Security Management

The CLEEN Foundation with support from the MacArthur Foundation published an Election Security Brief to highlight the potential security threats that the 2015 General Elections might generate. The brief identified as a principal source of security threat the emergence of the All Progressives Congress from a merger of the Action Congress of Nigeria (ACN), the Congress for Progressive Change (CPC), the All Nigerian Peoples Party (ANPP) and other smaller parties. Another principal source is the zoning arrangement for the presidency. Other threat factors include:

1. The persisting state of insecurity from the insurgency and activities of militants and vigilante groups,
2. The high stakes of election as a result of the availability of derivation revenues,
3. The ethnic heterogeneity that makes elite consensus more difficult to attain,
4. The difficult environmental terrain that makes policing of elections a herculean task.

The brief identified the involvement of various non-state actors in security related activities as a serious threat. These include the Ombatse (meaning time has come), which was responsible for the massacre of over 60 security personnel in Nassarawa state are clear indications that the Nigerian state is increasingly failing in its responsibility to protect its citizens. There are also the yan’daba in the North West region, especially in Kano, Kaduna, Katsina which have a history of youth militancy. Elections always provide an opportunity for them to become politically active on behalf of their principals. This threat is particularly serious in light of the fact of the influx of large numbers of military assault weapons in the country. Other militant youth groups include the Boko Haram and Ansaru, the ECOMOG in Borno state, and the Yan’Kalare and Sara-suka in Gombe and Bauchi states respectively.

In the South-West, the activities of various groups are also causes for concern. These include the Odua People’s Congress (OPC) in Lagos State and Operation Burst in Oyo state. Their counterparts in the South East included the Bakassi Boys and in the South-South zone the numerous militias and cults involved in the insurgency in the region.

The brief colour-coded a number of states as electoral hotspots that need to be kept under close security watch for possible outbreaks of violence before, during and after the elections. The green states (those featuring stability or the lowest threat) were Kwara, Jigawa, Zamfara, Kebbi, Abia, Cross-River, Akwa-Ibom, Ondo, Ekiti, and Osun. The amber state (with medium security threat) were Kogi, Niger, Gombe, Taraba, Kano, Kastina, Anambra, Enugu, Ebonyi, Imo, Edo, Bayelsa, Lagos, Oyo, and Ogun. The red states (representing the highest threat levels or the highest volatility) were Nassarawa, Plateau, Benue, Yobe, Borno, Adamawa, Bauchi, Kaduna, Sokoto, Rivers, and Delta. Key influencing factors in the categorisation were whether the governor is up for re-election, degree of control by incumbent and relationship with the federal government, stability of internal state party politics, questions of zoning, whether the ruling party or opposition controls the state, history of violence, and the activities of vigilante groups, militants, cultists, and insurgents.

The brief offered the following recommendations to manage security threats during the elections:
1. Election related stakeholders, including security agencies, INEC, political parties and civil society groups, must commence preparation for the 2015 elections and mainstream conflict management skills in their plans. Government at all levels should pay special attention to the violent hotspots with a view to empowering and equipping the relevant agencies for effectiveness.

2. Disbandment/Regulation of cults, militia and vigilante groups - state governments and security agencies should work to disband cults and militias and regulate violent vigilante groups that are often hired to intimidate voters and opposing party supporters.

3. Training of journalists on conflict sensitive reporting - the manner of media reporting of political conflicts has implications for the development and aggravation of violence. Media practitioners should be exposed to training on reporting of political conflicts to mitigate risks of their reports becoming triggers for violence.

4. Of key priority is the sustenance of engagement among key stakeholders such as INEC, security agencies, civil society organisations, religious, and community leaders is central to restoring the peoples’ confidence in the electoral process.

5. The government needs to respond to the socio-economic vulnerability of young people.

6. There criminal justice system needs improvement for effective prosecution of perpetrators of violence and proliferators of weapons and non-state actors violence.

7. All existing ethnic, religious and communal conflicts should be properly managed to avoid escalation during election. All political parties should be persuaded to sign a peace memorandum, stating their commitment to eschew violence and work peacefully before, during and after the election.
Training on Women Preventing Extreme Violence

The training on Women Preventing Extreme Violence (WPEV), an initiative of both the United State Institute of Peace (USIP) and the CLEEN Foundation took place between November 3 and 7, 2013 in Abuja. The main aim of the workshop was to train women to be in the fore-front in the fight against violent extremism.

The training featured the web streaming of ‘Sisters against Violent Extremism,’ a video about women from different races who had similar experiences and shared the same pain about their sons who had been arrested for extreme violence. It also featured presentations by resource persons.

Valkamiya Ahmadu, one of the resource persons, addressed the question of how CSOs could work effectively with the police, urging the participants and the CSOs to shed their stereotype cloaks, embrace the reforms in the police force, and try as much as possible to create a decent working environment with the police.

Isioma Kemakolam discussed the framework of operation of the Nigerian Police Force (NPF) worked and addressed, among other issues, the challenges of informal/community policing and discussed the importance of engaging the police productively and finding out realistic ways of sustaining the relationships and not ‘maintaining them’.

Dr. Fatima Akilu spoke on the role of women in preventing extreme violence and highlighted their important role in the eradication of radicalisation and extremism. She highlighted the need to build the capacity of rural women so that they would not fall victims to the false teachings of Islamic literature.

Police Training on Human Rights

The training on Human Rights for Officials of the Federal Capital Territory Central Intelligence Department of the Nigeria Police Force came up between September 23 and 27, 2013. It kicked off at 10:00 a.m. on September 23, 2013, following a request from the Deputy Commissioner of Police, State Criminal Investigation Department (SCID) FCT Command, for CLEEN Foundation’s assistance to train officials of the command’s CID on Human Rights, Investigations and Interrogation techniques.

The 5-day training involved ten topics:

1. Interviews and Interrogation Techniques (handled by Barrister Celestine I. Nmerole, a retired Assistant Commissioner of Police)
2. Introduction to the basics of Human Rights;
3. Torture and Inhumane treatment (Kemi Okenyodo)
4. Presumption of Innocence;
5. Fair Trial;
6. Right to Life;
7. Report Writing;
8. Gender and Policing;
9. Juvenile Justice
CLEN Foundation Organises Force Intelligence Bureau (FIB) Training

A two-day training capacity building workshop on Gender and Policing was organised by the CLEN Foundation for officers in the Gender Unit of the Force Intelligence Bureau (FIB). It took place in Abuja between June 27 and 28, 2013. Participants were drawn from different states and divisions of the FIB from all over the country. Nineteen officers attended the workshop.

In his remarks, the AIG in charge of FIB, Solomon Arase, noted the need to train and re-train the police especially, the unit on gender due to the current spate of security challenges that had affected the country, and in particular, issues of rape, gender-based violence, and youth restiveness amongst others. The training modules at the workshop included ‘Policing in a Democracy,’ handled by Mr. Chinedu Nwagwu, ‘Policing Women and Children’ by CLEN Foundation Executive Director Kemi Okenyodo, ‘Youths and Policing’ by Miss. Onyinye Onyemosisi, ‘Voluntary Policing Group’ again by Kemi Okenyodo, and Intelligence Analysis by Chinedu Nwagwu.

Participants in the training workshop for police officers on the use of the Stop-the-Bribe Platform

Continued from page 23

of low level corruption
2. Keep records of reports of low level corruption
3. Pass on reports of low level corruption to the relevant authorities and put pressure on the authorities to act on reports
4. Publicize the results of action taken and thereby encourage others to report incidences and create a deterrent to low level corrupt behaviour

The CLEN Foundation expects the project to result in:

1. Timely and regular reporting of incidences of bribery and corruption involving public functionaries in Nigeria, especial-
Continued from page 27

1. Identifying law enforcement officials by members of the public;
2. Popularization of use of technology in incident reporting and crowding sourcing platforms as tools for transparency, accountability and good governance campaign in Nigeria and beyond
3. Overall increase in members of the public willing to report cases of police low level bribery and extortion
4. Identifying police officers that are doing good work in the field
5. Ultimately reduction of levels of corruption and improving of good policing practices by celebrating and acknowledging the good officers

The Stop-the-Bribe Platform

The Stop-the-Bribe platform (www.stopthebribes.net) is at the heart of this project. The platform is a crowd-sourcing website that allows people to report bribery and extortion cases involving law enforcement or other public officials by sending messages from their phones, including plain text (SMS), pictures, videos, or any combination of these in multimedia messages (MMS). They can also send reports from social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter, Skype, and from blogs. The stop-the-bribe platform collates and analyses these reports and develops a corruption map from the data generated, showing corruption hotspots in Nigeria. This map, along with the base data (the reports, including pictures, video, and text messages) is fed to a Corruption Incidence Tracking Room set up at the Force Intelligence Bureau (FIB) in Nigeria Police Force headquarters in Abuja. The CLEEN Foundation set up the Room on February 20, 2013, equipping it with three internet-enabled 42-inch Flat-Screen television sets with Wi-Fi, three HP laptops, a server workstation, an inverter, and a six-month internet subscription. The Foundation also set up a similar room at its own headquarters in Lagos. The Wi-Fi television sets are logged on to the Stop-the-Bribe platform and are able to display the corruption map, giving officials a real-time view of corruption cases on an individual or collated basis, in terms of location and other details. This enables them to plan and implement interventions more efficiently to tackle low-level corruption among law enforcement officials and to address complaints by members of the public. The CLEEN Foundation collates all the data generated on the Stop-the-Bribe platform into a monthly reports that are published on its website, www.cleen.org, as well as on www.stopthebribes.net and http://stopthebribes.blogspot.com.

To facilitate the effective use of the Stop-the-Bribe platform and the Corruption Incidence Tracking Room by the police force, the CLEEN Foundation held a three-day training workshop for twenty-four project personnel of the force on February 11, 12, and 19. The training, which took place at the Foundation’s offices and Force Headquarters in Abuja, was handled by the Foundation’s ICT Programme Officer Gabriel Akinremi and involved officers from the Office of the Public Relations Officer, IGP secretariat, Force Intelligence Bureau, Force CID, Information Technology department, and Training department.

Results and Outcomes

The Stop-the-Bribe platform has generated important results since its launch in February 2013, in which
 month it received and processed thirty commendations of the police force and reports of low-level corruption involving its officers from different parts of the country. Forty-three reports were made between May and October 2013, though two months – June and September – had no reports. Twelve of these were in May and included one commendation in favour of the Commissioner of Police, Imo State Police Command. Nine of the complaints were from Lagos State, one from Ilorin, Kwara State, one from Aba, Abia State, and another one from Wudil, Kano State. In Lagos State, the nine reports concerned low level corruptions, bribery and extortion of members of the public by the Police Force whose names and service numbers were published on the platform.

Six reports were registered on the platform in July 2013, two from Abuja and four from Lagos. These included a commendation and complaints about low level corruption; bribery; and extortion of members of the public. The platform recorded ten reports in August, including one from Akwa-Ibom State and nine from Lagos State. All the reports involved low-level corruption, bribery, and extortion of members of the public by the police officers from the following police stations and area commands: Idimu, Ikotun and Gowon Estate Divisions in Area M Command; Ikorodu Police Division in Area N Command; Alapere police station in Area H Command; Ikoyi Police Division in Area A Command.

In October 2013, 15 reports were received. The reports comprised seven from Lagos State, three from the FCT, Abuja, two from Kaduna State and one each from Akwa-Ibom, Anambra, and Edo States. Three of the complaints concerned the misuse of firearms and extra-judicial killing, ten concerned low-level corruption, favouritism, unlawful practice, bribery, and extortion of members of the public, and two were commendations for good practices.

**Improving the Project**

The results generated so far by the Stop-the-Bribe platform indicate its immense potential as a tool against low-level corruption among law enforcement officials, and government agencies have begun to take note of it. For instance, the Ministry of the Interior has expressed to CLEEN Foundation its interest in developing a similar instrument for its agencies. To enhance the effectiveness of the existing platform the Foundation plans in 2014 to scale-up the publicity campaign to improve public awareness and use of it, including by such means as town-hall meetings, radio jingles, online publicity, and advocacy on radio and television.
CLEEN Foundation Monitors Anambra Gubernatorial Election

On Saturday, November 16, 2013, the Anambra State gubernatorial election was conducted by the Independent National Electoral Commission (INEC), and, in line with its commitment to promoting election security under its Election Security Management project, a number of activities targeted at promoting effective and accountable policing of the election were implemented by CLEEN Foundation, with support from the United Kingdom (UK) Department for International Development (DFID)'s Justice for All (J4A) Programme.

The activities included:

1. A pre-election security threat assessment;
2. A one-day training workshop on election security management for Divisional Police Officers in the Anambra state command;
3. Training of observers, and,
4. The establishment of a call centre.

Pre-Election Security Threat Assessment
The Foundation conducted a pre-election security threat assessment the final report of which identified key risk factors, possible flash points, and a synthesis of the threats and mitigating factors. The report of the threat assessment was disseminated to the Independent National Electoral Commission (INEC), the leadership of the Police, observer groups and used in training police officials in the state.

Training of Divisional Police Officers (DPOs) on Elections Security Management
A one-day training workshop was organised for Divisional Police Officers (DPOs) and other senior officers in the Anambra State Police Command on Friday, November 8, 2013, at Awka, Anambra state. Forty-eight senior police officers of the Anambra State Police command participated. The training, which was facilitated by Mr Chinedu Nwagu and Mrs Isioma Kemakolam of CLEEN Foundation and declared open by the State Commissioner of Police, Bala Nassarawa (represented by the Deputy Commissioner Operations), covered the following subjects:

1. Role of the Police in Securing Democratic Elections,
2. Review of the Performance of security agencies in previous elections,
3. Police Service Commission (PSC) Guidelines on the Conduct of the...
Police during Electoral Duty and Electoral offences and enforcement

4. The pre-election security threat assessment for Anambra state was also discussed with the participants for their input and validation

**Training of Observers**

The CLEEN Foundation trained and deployed sixty-three observers for the Anambra State gubernatorial election. The observers were trained at a one-day workshop held on Thursday, November 14, 2013 at Awka, Anambra State. The training subject included:

1. Review of the conduct of security officials in the 2011 elections,
2. A discussion of the security threat assessment for Anambra state,
3. INEC Guidelines on Election Observation and the PSC Guidelines for the Conduct of Police officials on electoral Duty

The observers were instructed on how to conduct themselves in the field during the election and on how to complete the Observation Checklists, and they were equipped with observer kits. Fifty-six observers participated in the training facilitated by Chinedu Nwagu, Valkamiya Ahmadu, and Ifeanyi Anyanwu.

**Publication of PSC Guidelines in National Newspapers**

The CLEEN Foundation published abridged versions of the PSC Guidelines in two national dailies widely read in Anambra State. The publications are ‘Daily Sun’ and ‘The Guardian’ newspapers. The guidelines were published in the Daily Sun Newspaper (page 23) and The Guardian Newspaper (page 41) on Thursday, November 14, 2013. These publications helped promote public awareness on the role of security officials on electoral duty and to also invite them to report incidents through the phone numbers (and Twitter handles) of CLEEN Foundation Call centre, Ministry of Police Affairs and the Civil Society Election Situation Room that were provided.

**Setting up of Collation Centre and Observation of the Elections**

During the gubernatorial election, the CLEEN Foundation set up a call and collation centre at Mayroses Hotel, Awka, Anambra State to monitor field activities on election day, receive reports and liaise with relevant government institutions. The collation centre interfaced with both stationary and roving observers deployed to different local government areas across the state. The call centre related information received on the conduct of security officials and other incidents that affected the peace of the election, to the coordinating team and shared the information with the relevant government agencies so that they could address the issues as they occurred. We also maintained a presence in the Election Situation Room and interfaced information with them. After the elections, the collation centre facilitated in retrieving information and the completed checklists from the observers.

**Press briefing held on Findings from Observation of the Elections**

After the election on November 16, 2013, a press conference was held on Sunday, November 17, 2013 at De Geogold Hotel and Suites, Awka, Anambra State to present the preliminary report of findings from the observation of the Anambra gubernatorial election. The briefing was attended by about eight media houses (both print and electronic). The report was disseminated widely and reported by several media houses.
Voluntary Policing Project

Purpose and Goals
The Voluntary Policing Project has the purpose of supporting the development of the voluntary policing sector (VPS) of Nigeria’s security infrastructure to improve the responsiveness and effectiveness of its service delivery, enhance the accountability of VPS organisations to the communities they serve, and improve their cooperation with the Nigeria Police Force at the divisional command level. This is against the background of the growing importance of vigilante groups, community watches, and other informal policing organisations (all of which comprise the voluntary policing sector) in the delivery of security services to an increasing number of communities across Nigeria. At the heart of the project is the concern that this growing importance of voluntary policing organisations has generally been accompanied by gross violations by them, sometimes violent conflict among them and between them and the formal police force, and lack of transparency and accountability in their operations and administration. These organisations have immense security value in light of the capacity-limitations of the police in the face of the growing security threats in the country. However, the human rights violations and violent conflicts associated with their operations also constitute a serious problem for both citizens and the government. Further, the lack of transparency and accountability holds the risk of the their transformation to crime organisations behind the mask of providing security services to their communities. The Voluntary Policing Project is the CLEEN Foundation’s interventional instrument to address these issues. The project’s specific objectives are to:

1. Enhance the organisational and management capacity of selected VPS groups
2. Strengthen the capacity of selected VPS groups to deliver the services that citizens need and want with due regard for the law
3. Enhance VPS engagement with, and accountability to, their local communities in selected locations
4. Enhance levels of coordination between VPS groups and the NPF and other relevant groups at local levels, and
5. Disseminate examples of good practice to VPS groups in lead states and across Nigeria and encourage other groups to replicate and adopt them.

The Foundation’s intended outcome of the project is that citizens in the selected locations for the project intervention will feel safer in their com-
munities and have confidence in VPS groups that they will respond appropriately to the safety and security needs of all members of the community.

Activities and Outcomes
The Foundation ran the Voluntary Policing Project in Kano, Enugu, and Lagos states in 2013. The activities in the period were:

1. Mapping VPS groups in Kano and Enugu, to identify those that were working in the field, what they were doing and how, and their levels of competency and effectiveness.
2. Validation of the report of findings from the mapping exercise.
3. Training of VPS groups on organisational management to enhance their leadership skills, draft or strengthen procedures for recruitment of new members, formulate policies and procedures governing their functions, and facilitate networking among VPS leaders for sharing of best practices.
4. Service delivery training workshops for VPS groups on human rights (with specific attention to women’s rights), basic policing skills, conflict management and joint problem-solving, and organisational management.
5. Donation of equipment to support the operations of the groups, including flashlights, whistles, rain coats, rain boots, and arm bands.

The training workshops for VPS groups constituted one of the most important aspects of the project, as they were the principal means by which the Foundation sought to build their appreciation of the human rights of citizens and build their operational capacity. A series of these workshops held in Enugu in May and June 2013 for one hundred and five members and officials of neighbourhood watches in which they were trained in human rights, conflict management, basic policing skills, and organisational management. Also, four step-down training workshops were conducted for another set of one hundred and ninety members and officials of neighbourhood watches in Abakpa, Awkunanaw, and the Central Police Station areas. This brought the total of VPS members trained to two hundred and fifty-nine. Similar training workshops for members and officials of neighbourhood watches held in Kano from August to October 2013. Four hundred of these members and officials - drawn from Sabon Gari, Bompai, Farm Centre, Wudil, and Hotoro Police Divisions were trained in human rights.
rights, conflict management, basic policing skills, and organisational management.

The Community Accountability Forums were another key element of the Voluntary Policing Project. The core functions of the forums are to:

1. Address challenges faced by NPF, VPS members and community members, including issues of non-corporation of community members with the police in intelligence gathering, the non-availability of such security facilities as streetlights, and financial support for the operation of VPS groups
2. Facilitate and coordinate actions to resolve problems, including those associated with ethnic tensions and conflict
3. Serve as a community complaint bureau for the application of disciplinary measures against VPS group of their members for breaches of agreements with the community

Functioning initially only as complaints mechanisms enabling communities and their individual members to register complaints against the police or the VPS groups, the Community Accountability Forums developed in the course of the project into complaints-and-feedback mechanisms. This allowed interaction between the communities, the police and the VPS groups, during which the police and these groups could give security briefs and the various parties could share security-related information, resolve community disputes peacefully, and enforce compliance with agreements between communities and VPS group. The forums received 51 complaints in 2013 of which 38 were resolved.

Another important mechanism under the project is the Coordination Forums including the police force and the VPS groups. Already operational in Lagos and Enugu, the NPF-VPS Coordination Forum is an oversight mechanism that enables the Nigeria Police force to oversee and regulate the operations of VPS groups and allows bilateral and multi-lateral interactions for the sharing of ideas and good practices, and provides a forum for mutual support. These forums have played an important role in building trust between the police and the VPS groups. In Lagos, for example, they conduct joint patrols and visitations to schools to educate teachers and students on security issues. The have also engaged in joint interventions to resolve conflicts among or within VPS groups. Also, in Enugu a joint training workshop was held for the police force and VPS groups in July 2013 to build their cooperation in community policing. The workshop provided an opportunity for experience sharing on best practices, with members of the NPF-VPS Forum in Lagos addressing participants on Voluntary policing organisations have immense security value in light of the capacity-limitations of the police in the face of the growing security threats in the country.
PUBLIC SAFETY AND SECURITY PROGRAMME

Two years into its operation, the Voluntary Policing Project has already recorded important achievements. In addition to the vastly improved relations and coordination between the police and VPS organisations, some communities have enjoyed improved services from the latter. For instance, an average of 67% of community members participating in a monthly satisfaction survey conducted under the project in Isokoko in Lagos indicated satisfaction with their work. In Enugu State, the police commissioner and the ministry of human capital development have entered into consultations with the project on organising a state-wide training and sensitisation programme on the Neighbourhood Watch Law for all neighbourhood watches in the state. The proposed project will involve the production and distribution of the law in a small booklet to facilitate awareness among these groups and the general public.

The CLEEN Foundation hopes to be able to continue the project in Kano State, where security concerns hampered certain aspects of project implementation. We also hope to extend it to other states not covered at present under the present project plan, thus helping to enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of the VPS groups and improving the security of citizens in Nigeria.
The CLEEN Foundation’s activities under its Research and Planning Programme included the annual national crime victimisation survey, a study of mobility and security challenges in West Africa, and Afrobarometer fifth-round survey.

The primary aim of the crime victimisation survey was to understand the trends and changes in crime in the country. The Afrobarometer survey measured attitudes toward governance, democracy, the economy, identity, and other important issues. Finally, the mobility and security project studied trends in migration in the West African sub-region and the security challenges it entails.

The National Crime Victimization and Safety Survey

The CLEEN Foundation conducted a national crime victimization and safety survey in Nigeria from June 17 to July 14, 2013. The purpose of the survey was to determine changes in Nigerians’ experience and perception of crime, safety, security, and justice in the country since the survey conducted in the previous year. The Foundation sought by this means to gauge the level of the sense of security or insecurity prevalent among citizens and to identify the variations of this level across geographical and social areas. These social areas included road safety, corruption, and criminal justice administration. Employing the household survey method, the project used a population sample of 11,518 Nigerians equally distributed among male and female adults aged 18 years and above from all the 36 States in the country and the Federal Capital Territory.

Practical Sampling International (PSI), a reputable Nigeria-based research company with wide experience in quantitative research, conducted fieldwork for the survey, and DC Pro-Data Consult Limited did the data processing. The CLEEN Foundation however monitored the conduct of the fieldwork as an initial quality control measure research team and supervised the processing of the generated data.

About the Research and Planning Programme

The Research and Planning Programme provides and promotes the use of empirical and quantitative data in the formulation of crime prevention, public safety, and security policies, as well as in the evaluation of the impact of those policies. Its areas of work are the conduct of surveys and exploratory studies, the development of indicators and measures, the development of crime maps, and the monitoring and evaluation of crime policies and programmes.

The programme conducts its activities through three project units: Surveys and Exploratory Studies, Indicators and Measurements, Crime Mapping, and Monitoring and Evaluation.

Surveys and Exploratory Studies: These provide policy makers and other interested stakeholders with reliable empirical data on crime, victimization and other public safety issues through the conduct of local and national surveys and exploratory studies.

Indicators and Measurements: This unit promotes the development and use of indicators for measuring progress in the field of Safety and Justice and the work of CLEEN Foundation.
Selected Findings of the Survey

Some findings of the survey are presented below:

1. Fear of Crime (fear of becoming a victim of crime): More than 7 out of 10 Nigerians (72%) feared becoming victims of crime. Ogun and Ondo states recorded the highest levels of fear of crime, with each posting 94% of respondents. Benue and Taraba states recorded the lowest levels with 38%. The national average was 72%. Analysed by gender, the data showed that 73% of female respondents feared becoming victims of crime compared to 71% of male respondents who expressed similar fears.

2. Criminal Victimisation (actually being a victim of crime, as opposed to fear of being a victim): Twenty-five percent of respondents reported having experienced criminal victimisation over the past year, representing a 6% decline from the 31% recorded in 2012. Criminal victimisation was highest in Enugu State with 70% of respondents reported having actually been victims of crime, followed by Ekiti and Ebonyi states both with 65% of respondents. Lagos State recorded 18%, Katsina State 9%, and Ogun State 5% - the lowest score. The national average was 25%. Disaggregated by region, the experience of crime was highest in the South East with 44% of respondents reporting criminal victimisation, while the North West recorded the lowest score of 18%. Gender disaggregation indicated that more men (27%) had actual experiences of crime compared to women (23%).

The National Crime and Safety Survey is an annual perception survey conducted in Nigeria by the CLEEN Foundation with support from the MacArthur Foundation. Please see our website for details of the survey findings.

Afrobarometer Round 5 Survey

In May 2013, the first dissemination activity of the Afrobarometer Round 5 survey in Nigeria took place in Lagos. The activity was organised by the CLEEN Foundation in collaboration with the Centre for Democratic Development CDD-Ghana and the Afrobarometer Network.

The Afrobarometer (AB) is a series of comparative public opinion surveys measuring attitudes toward governance, democracy, the economy, iden-
The Afrobarometer survey has come to be recognised over the years and used by policy makers, researchers, the media and the general public as a very reliable tool for assessing public perception in Africa. The Afrobarometer data offers citizens an effective means of assessing progress and change in Africa. For example, the report of the 2013 survey entitled ‘Towards Putting Tax Returns on Public Records in Nigeria’, highlighted the attitudes and perception of Nigerians on tax and fiscal management in Nigeria. The report identified interesting patterns on national pride, trust among individuals, awareness of tax policies and rules as well as perception of tax agencies in Nigeria.

Some Findings of the Afrobarometer Survey

Public Attitude to Tax and Taxation in Nigeria

1. A majority of respondents were proud to be called Nigerians - In general, the survey indicated that three of every four Nigerians (75%) were proud to be called Nigerians.
2. A majority of Nigerians had never refused to pay taxes to government coffers - The survey indicated a willingness on the part of majority of Nigerians to pay tax, given that nearly nine in ten of them (89%) said that had never refused to pay tax. Only 6% of them admitted that they had defaulted at least once on tax.

3. Nearly all the respondents (95%) believed that tax authorities at various levels were involved in corruption. This number was made up of 58% who believed that all of them/most of them were involved and 37% who believed that some of them were involved. Not surprisingly, only 3% of the respondents trusted the Federal Inland Revenue Service (FIRS).

Political and Democratic Attitudes in Nigeria

1. Most Nigerians prefer the selection of leaders through regular, open and honest elections - The survey in Nigeria revealed that majority of the citizens (80 percent) prefer the selection of leaders through regular, open and honest elections; only 20 percent preferred the adoption of other methods of choosing leaders in the country because they believe that elections sometimes produce bad results.

2. Over half of Nigerians (54 percent) agreed that women should be given the same chances as men in election to political offices. However, 46 percent believed that men make better political leaders than women, and should be elected rather than women.

3. Another majority (68 percent) said that women should have equal rights and receive the same treatment as men, while a minority (32 percent) was of the opinion that women had always been subject to traditional laws and customs in the country, and that status quo should be maintained.

4. A majority of Nigerians believed that there should be plurality of political parties in the country to enhance the democratic process. Fifty-five percent believed that many political parties were needed to ensure that Nigerians have real choices in who governs them and less than half of the citizens (44 percent) believe that political parties create divisions and confusion and that therefore it was not necessary to have many political parties in the country.

5. The survey revealed that a large population of Nigerians (47 percent) consider democracy in the country as being problematic, 35 percent believed the problems bedeviling the country’s democracy are minor, 10 percent believed there is no operational democracy in the country, and only 7 percent say there is full democracy in the
40

CLEEN FOUNDATION

Promoting Public Safety, Security and Justice

CLEEN FOUNDATION

RESEARCH AND PLANNING PROGRAMME

country

6. Forty-one percent of citizens were not very satisfied with the way democracy worked in the country, 25 percent expressed a very high level of dissatisfaction, 28 percent were fairly satisfied, 2 percent believed that the country was not democratic and only 4 percent were satisfied.

CLEEN Foundation hosts Methodology and Inception Meeting on Mobility and Security Challenges in West Africa

The Project on Mobility and Security Challenges in West Africa is a research and advocacy project aimed at studying trends in migration and security management in five identified borders in West Africa. The goal of the project was to increase understanding of the trends and dynamics in mobility and the security of borders in the region. The project is funded by the Open Society Foundations (OSF) through its New Executives Fund (NEF) initiative from June 2013 to June 2015.

The project will conduct field studies and interviews with travellers, officials and other border users in land border crossings across the ECOWAS Co-Prosperity Alliance Zone (COPAZ) by singling out the borders between Nigeria and Benin; Benin and Togo; Togo and Ghana as well as in the Cote d’Ivoire migration corridor where the borders between Cote d’Ivoire and Mali on the one hand and Cote d’Ivoire and Burkina Faso on the other hand will be singled out.

The project is one of CLEEN Foundation’s initiatives for developing the migration and securitisation portfolio of work and serves as a crucial follow up to a number of earlier projects on migration and law enforcement in the sub-region. Project outputs are expected to include publication of research findings through policy briefs and a book as well as a number of advocacy outreaches to regional institutions and civil society organisations in the region. The second phase of the project is envisaged to significantly broaden CLEEN Foundation’s intervention on migration and mobility in West Africa.

In implementing the OSF-NEF grant for the project on Mobility and Security Challenges in West Africa, the CLEEN Foundation organised and hosted a 2-day methodology and inception meeting. This is the first line activity on the project and it was intended to afford the field researchers, the project team and invited technical experts the opportunity to under-stand the project objectives, goals and activities as well as adequately prepare them for the roles ahead. The meeting was attended by all five field researchers, two experts and the project team which was made up of three programme staff and the Executive Director of the CLEEN Foundation.

The objectives of the meeting were as follows:

1. Project Research Methodology including the questionnaire, researchers’ code of ethics and project timelines would have been

ABOVE: CLEEN Foundation Executive Director, Kemi Okenyodo, with participants in the methodology and inception meeting on mobility and security challenges in West Africa
RESEARCH AND PLANNING PROGRAMME

The methodology meeting took place on October 28, 2013. This was a small preparatory meeting between the experts and the project team. The purpose was to understand the project goals and objectives and thereafter revise the draft questionnaire prepared by the project team. The goal was to develop a research tool that will be clear and effectively used by researchers to collect a rich data that can be analysed in different ways.

Key points raised during deliberations included the fact that the fieldwork should build on, and be careful not to replicate the Beyond Declarations study. Also, it was considered whether the study should be explorative scoping and seek to document “what is going on in the field” or develop tentative proposals which can then be tested. It was agreed however that the current research would be explorative. When the data is analysed, its findings could form the basis for developing the propositions to be tested in the next phase of the project.

One gap in knowledge identified was in the level and extent of enforcement of ECOWAS protocol at the border. There is thus the need to design a separate questionnaire to be administered among security and enforcement agents at the border. This could further be supported by interviews with heads of agencies that are not based at the border, to identify whether their instructions are matching with the practices of field operatives.

Another area identified for studies is the borderland communities – these include groups whose ancestral lands have been pierced by the borders as well as those who have sedentary lives at the borders (traders, officials, students and their relations). These groups are recognised to be important because they are always crossing the borders and probably have good knowledge of trends in mobility and border usage, nature of harassments and security violations at the borders as well as nature of trade (both licit and illicit).

Future research projects could explore the dynamics of twin communities and the informal flow of migration across areas with shared culture.

The second day of the meeting was Tuesday, October 29, 2013, and this session had the researchers, project team and experts in attendance. The session began with introductions and overview of the project as well as a recap of CLEEN Foundation’s previous work on migration. This was followed by a discussion of the opportunities and challenges of the ECOWAS Free Movement architecture which formed the basis of the research to be conducted. Discussions of the survey instrument covered the sample size which was agreed to be 40 per case study with respondents divided among travellers and the border community.

2. Researchers and Technical Committee understand their roles and obligations in the project as well as channels of communication and reporting.

3. CLEEN Foundation understands and agrees to its obligations to field researchers and Technical Committee and commits to supporting stakeholders to achieve project objectives.

4. All participants have clear understanding of the project expectations, roles, communication channels and timelines.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The CLEEN Foundation is today one of the leading non-governmental organisations in the security and justice sector because of the relevance of our projects in addressing the challenges arising in that sector.

These projects have only been translated from mere ideas to actual activities because of the generous support of our donors and partners.

We therefore wish to acknowledge with thanks the support of these donors and partners in 2013. These include:

1. MacArthur Foundation
2. Ford Foundation
3. Open Society Initiative for West Africa
4. Cordaid
5. Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany
6. Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
7. American Bar Association
8. Vera Institute

We thank also all our partners in the domestic and global civil society who worked with us in the period.
The CLEEN Foundation acknowledges the support of our funders, especially the Ford Foundation and MacArthur Foundation. We look to the future with great hope, that with continuing support from our funders and partners the Foundation will continue to conceive and implement projects that will promote security and justice in Nigeria and beyond.

- Etannibi ALEMIKA, Board Chair of CLEEN Foundation
CLEEN Foundation, originally named the Centre for Law Enforcement Education is a civil society organization established in 1998. Its mission is to promote public safety, security and justice through empirical research, legislative advocacy, demonstration programmes and publications in partnership with government and civil society. It has carried out its mission largely through a strategy of building successful civil-state partnerships in justice reform.

CLEEN Foundation is valued by the demand side, trusted by the supply side, and recognised by the Nigerian security sector due to its proven and visible positive impact on police and policing in Nigeria. It is acknowledged by international partners, government Ministries, Departments & Agencies, Civil Society Organisations, and beneficiaries as an organization that does serious work in research, awareness & capacity building of other Civil Society Organisations at the grassroots. It does extensive and useful research that is easily interpreted by the layman; it publishes evidence-based reports, acts with integrity, and delivers results for its partners.

The Foundation has offices in 3 zones of the country: Lagos, Abuja and Imo; has a presence in all 36 states; and is part of global alliances & coalitions, possessing strong links with civil society organisations and state agencies in Africa.